

## Part B Consultation Questions

Please indicate your preference by checking the appropriate boxes. Please reply to the questions below on the proposed changes discussed in the Consultation Paper downloadable from the HKEx website at: <http://www.hkex.com.hk/eng/newsconsul/mktconsul/Documents/cp201112.pdf>.

Where there is insufficient space provided for your comments, please attach additional pages.

1. Should the ESG Guide be a recommended best practice appended to the Listing Rules?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

To promote ESG awareness and reporting, the ESG Guide should be a recommended best practice appended to the Listing Rules for issuers’ reference and benchmarking.

2. Do you agree with the proposed Main Board Listing Rule 13.91 and paragraph 53 of Appendix 16/ GEM Listing Rules 17.103 and 18.84 in Appendix I of the Consultation Paper?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

## Content of the proposed Environmental, Social and Governance Reporting Guide

### Introduction

3. Do you agree with the Introduction section?

The proposed Introduction section states:

1. This guide sets out Environmental, Social and Governance (“ESG”) subject areas, aspects, general disclosure and key performance indicators (“KPIs”).
2. This guide is not comprehensive. We encourage an issuer to identify and disclose additional ESG issues and KPIs that are relevant to its business. It may also refer to existing international ESG reporting guidance for its relevant industry or sector.
3. An issuer may adopt a higher level of ESG reporting based on international guidance and standards.
4. An issuer may disclose the ESG information in its annual report regarding the same period covered in the annual report, or in a separate report, in print or on its website. Where the information is included in a separate report, an issuer is free to report on any period.
5. It is important to involve the board of directors in preparing the ESG report. The board of directors is responsible for ESG reporting but it may delegate the task of compiling the ESG report to its employees or a committee that reports to the board.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Paragraph 4 under the Introduction section can be enhanced. Particularly, we are of the view that ESG information may be included in a separate report apart from the annual report; however, the coverage period of such report is recommended to be consistent with that of the annual report.

In order for users to effectively correlate the disclosed ESG statistics and information with business financials and performance of the same period, issuer should be encouraged to provide a set of ESG information that covers a period consistent with the annual report which enables users to comprehend with ease.

As such, it is suggested that paragraph 4 could be modified and read as follows:

*“4. An issuer may disclose the ESG information in its annual report regarding the same period covered in the annual report, or in a separate report, in print or on its website. Where the information is included in a separate report, ~~an issuer is free to report on any period~~ the coverage period of the report could be consistent with that of the annual report.”*

## General Approach

4. Do you agree with the guidance under the General Approach section?

The proposed General Approach section states:

*Identify subject areas, aspects and indicators that are relevant*

8. Not all ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs in this Guide may be relevant to an issuer's business. Also, some may be more important to an issuer's business than others. For example, product responsibility, an ESG aspect, may be important to a retailer.
9. The ESG report could prioritise ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs that are material in the context of its corporate strategy, which could be given prominence in the report.
10. It is unnecessary to report on all subject areas, aspects and KPIs. An issuer could identify and report on relevant ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs that have material environmental and social impacts. Materiality can be addressed in strategic, operational and financial terms.

*Engage stakeholders*

11. It is important to engage stakeholders to identify material aspects and KPIs and understand their views. Stakeholders are parties that have interests in or are affected by the decisions and activities of an issuer. They may include shareholders (including independent shareholders), business partners, employees, suppliers, sub-contractors, consumers, regulators and the public.
12. The ESG report could disclose the issuer's stakeholders and the basis for their identification. It may also disclose the activities the issuer has arranged to engage stakeholders, the objectives and how it has responded to stakeholders' views. Stakeholder engagement may be conducted through meetings (e.g. personal or annual general meetings), conferences, workshops, advisory committees, round-table discussions, focus groups, questionnaires, web-based forums and written consultations.
13. The ESG report may also disclose a mechanism for stakeholders to provide feedback.

Yes

No

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

## Reporting guidance

5. Do you agree with the guidance under the Reporting Guidance section?

The proposed Reporting Guidance section states:

### *Scope of reporting*

14. The ESG report could state which entities in the group and/or which operations have been included for the report. If there is change in the scope, the issuer could explain the difference and reason for change.

### *Approaches to reporting*

15. Once an issuer starts reporting, it could continue to do so regularly. The aspects and KPIs reported could be consistent for each period or there could be an explanation of the changes. An issuer may also explain why some aspects and KPIs are not reported.
16. An ESG report could state the issuer's ESG management approach, strategies, priorities, objectives and explain how they relate to its business. It could discuss the issuer's management, measurement and monitoring system to implement its ESG strategies.
17. An ESG report could also discuss ESG opportunities, risks, challenges and how they are addressed. For example, a telecommunication company may see an opportunity to promote teleconferencing as an alternative to travel due to climate change concerns. An information and technology company may see the damage to its reputation from a breach in consumer privacy as an ESG risk.

### *Reporting on line items*

18. The Guide does not provide a definition for each KPI. An issuer could explain how the KPIs are calculated and include information that is necessary for interpreting the KPIs. It may use the same definition and calculation method each period for comparison over time. If there is a change to the definition or calculation method, the issuer could explain the difference and reason for the change.
19. Over time, an issuer may present time series of data for comparison over a period already reported on. The time period used may be consistent for every report.
20. An issuer may report line items with objective and representative industry benchmarks.
21. Quantitative information could be presented in a table format.

Yes

No

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

Key ESG Subject Areas

6. Do you agree with the proposed ESG areas, namely: Workplace Quality, Environmental Protection, Operating Practices and Community Involvement?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

Aspects for each ESG Area

7. Do you agree with the following proposed aspects?

| Areas and aspects  |
|--|
| <b>A. Workplace quality</b><br>Aspect A1 Working Conditions<br>Aspect A2 Health and safety<br>Aspect A3 Development and training<br>Aspect A4 Labour standards |
| <b>B. Environmental protection</b><br>Aspect B1 Emissions<br>Aspect B2 Use of resources<br>Aspect B3 The environment and natural resources                     |
| <b>C. Operating practices</b><br>Aspect C1 Supply chain management<br>Aspect C2 Product responsibility<br>Aspect C3 Anti-corruption                            |
| <b>D. Community involvement</b><br>Aspect D1 Community investment  |

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

**A. Workplace quality**

Aspect A1    Working conditions

8. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A1: Working conditions?

Information on:

- (a) the policies; and
- (b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on compensation and dismissal, recruitment and promotion, working hours, rest periods, diversity and other benefits and welfare.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

9. Do you agree to include KPI A1.1: “Total workforce by employment type, age group and geographical region”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Gender could also be included as a KPI factor as it provides information regarding the issuer's recruitment and management strategy, including equal employment opportunity.

According to “**Equal Opportunity for Women in the Workplace: A Study of Corporate Disclosure**” issued by the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants (“ACCA”):

*“Reporting beyond the basic GRI indicators on gender/diversity was explained by some as an attempt to portray the firm's particular commitment to these issues, to potential recruits and to staff.”<sup>1</sup>*

As such, it is suggested that KPI A1.1 could be enhanced and read as follows:

*KPI A1.1: “Total workforce by employment type, **gender**, age group and geographical region”*

<sup>1</sup> *Equal Opportunity for Women in the Workplace: A Study of Corporate Disclosure. ACCA, 2008.*

10. Do you agree to include KPI A1.2: “Employee turnover rate by age group and geographical region”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

In connection with our view as stipulated under Question 9, it is suggested that KPI A1.2 could be enhanced and read as follows:

*KPI A1.2: “Employee turnover rate by age group, **gender** and geographical region”*

11. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A1?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

Aspect A2     Health and safety

12. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A2: Health and safety?

Information on:

- (a) the policies; and
- (b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on providing a safe working environment and protecting employees from occupational hazards.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

13. Do you agree to include KPI A2.1: “Fatality number and rate”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Fatality number and rate are significant indicators in the Health and Safety aspect. As such, we are of the view that the related KPI can be enhanced to include distribution of the causes to fatality incidents, including suicide, accident, sickness and other factors. Such information provides a better picture for readers in regards to the Health and Safety aspect of the issuer.

14. Do you agree to include KPI A2.2: “Lost days due to work injury”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

15. Do you agree to include KPI A2.3: “Description of occupational health and safety measures adopted, how they are implemented and monitored”?



Yes

No

If you answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternate views.

Not applicable.

16. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A2?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Based on our knowledge database, the Health and Safety Executive (HSE) of the United Kingdom defines thermal comfort in the work place as between 13 °C and 30 °C. The United Kingdom also has regulatory requirements for minimum workplace temperature to be 13 °C.<sup>1</sup>

The Exchange is encouraged to consider establishing a KPI relating to working environment with exception temperature.

<sup>1</sup>Minimum and Maximum Temperature in Workplace. Health and Safety Executive., 2012.

Aspect A3    Development and training

17. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A3: Development and training?

Policies on improving employees’ knowledge and skills for discharging duties at work.

Training refers to vocational training. It may include internal and external courses paid by the employer.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

18. Do you agree to include KPI A3.1: “Description of training activities provided and if relevant, the percentage of employees trained by employee category (e.g. senior management, middle management, etc.)”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

19. Do you agree to include KPI A3.2: “The average training hours completed per employee by employee category”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

20. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A3?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

Aspect A4    Labour standards

21. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A4: Labour standards?

Information on:

(a) the policies; and

(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on preventing child or forced labour.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

22. Do you agree to include KPI A4.1: “Description of measures to review employment practices to avoid child and forced labour”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

23. Do you agree to include KPI A4.2: “Description of steps taken to eliminate such practices when discovered”?

Yes

No

If you answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternate views.

Not applicable.

24. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A4?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

**B. Environmental protection**

Aspect B1 Emissions

25. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect B1: Emissions?

Information on:

(a) the policies; and

(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on air and greenhouse gas emissions, discharges into water and land, generation of hazardous and non-hazardous wastes, etc.

Air emissions include NO<sub>x</sub>, SO<sub>x</sub>, and other pollutants regulated under national laws and regulations.

Greenhouse gases include carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide, hydrofluorocarbons, perfluorocarbons and sulphur hexafluoride.

Hazardous wastes are those defined by national regulations.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

26. Do you agree to include KPI B1.1: “The types of emissions and respective emissions data”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

27. Do you agree to include KPI B1.2: “Greenhouse gas emissions in total (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)?”

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

28. Do you agree to include KPI B1.3: “Total hazardous waste produced (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)?”

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

29. Do you agree to include KPI B1.4: “Total non-hazardous waste produced (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)?”

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

30. Do you agree to include KPI B1.5: “Description of measures to mitigate emissions and results achieved”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

31. Do you agree to include KPI B1.6: “Description of how hazardous and non-hazardous wastes are handled, reduction initiatives and results achieved”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

In additions, we are of the view that it would be more comprehensive to include data such as recycled and re-used wastes (in tonnes) as supplementary data to “reduction initiatives and results achieved” in KPI B1.6.

32. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect B1?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

Aspect B2    Use of resources

33. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect B2: Use of resources?

Policies on efficient use of resources including energy, water and other raw materials.

Resources may be used in production, in storage, transportation, in buildings, electronic equipment, etc.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternate views.

Not applicable.

34. Do you agree to include KPI B2.1: “Energy consumption by type (e.g. electricity, gas or oil) in total (kwh in ‘000s) and intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternate views.

Not applicable.

35. Do you agree to include KPI B2.2: “Water consumption in total and intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternate views.

Not applicable.

36. Do you agree to include KPI B2.3: “Description of energy use efficiency initiatives and results achieved”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

37. Do you agree to include KPI B2.4: “Description of whether there is any issue in sourcing water that is fit for purpose, water efficiency initiatives and results achieved”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

38. Do you agree to include KPI B2.5: “Total packaging material used (in tonnes), and if applicable, with reference to per unit produced”?

Yes



No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

39. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect B2?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

Aspect B3    The environment and natural resources

40. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect B3: The environment and natural resources?

Policies on minimizing the operation’s significant impact on the environment and natural resources.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

41. Do you agree to include KPI B3.1: “Total paper used”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

42. Do you agree to include KPI B3.2: “Paper use efficiency initiatives and results achieved”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

43. Do you agree to include KPI B3.3: “Description of the significant impacts of activities on the environment and natural resources and the actions taken to manage them”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

44. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect B3?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

**C. Operating practices**

Aspect C1    Supply chain management

45. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C1: Supply chain management?

Policies on risk management of supply chain.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

46. Do you agree to include KPI C1.1: “Number of suppliers by geographical region”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

47. Do you agree to include KPI C1.2: “Description of practices relating to engaging suppliers, number of suppliers where the practices are being implemented, how they are implemented and monitored”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

48. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect C1?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals

We propose to include “Percentage of production and service contractor that affirmed with the Business Code of Conduct” as a KPI for Aspect C1.

“Percentage of production and service contractor that affirmed with the Business Code of Conduct” encourages issuers to identify and enter into business relationships with production or service partners that have pledged to comply with applicable laws, regulations, and conduct their businesses with a level of business integrity and social responsibility.

Food and Beverage, Health, and other industries that hold relatively high responsibility to customer’s health may be encouraged to disclose such KPI. For instance, companies including Pepsi, Ferrero (listed in the New York Stock Exchange) and Cathay Pacific (listed in the HKEx) have already adopted the practice by disclosing similar information.

Aspect C2    Product responsibility

49. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C2: Product responsibility?

Information on:

(a) the policies; and

(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on health and safety, advertising, labelling, privacy and methods of redress.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

50. Do you agree to include KPI C2.1: “Percentage of total products sold or shipped subject to recalls for safety and health reasons”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

51. Do you agree to include KPI C2.2: “Number of products and service related complaints received and how they are dealt with”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

52. Do you agree to include KPI C2.3: “Description of practices relating to observing and protecting intellectual property rights”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

53. Do you agree to include KPI C2.4: “Description of quality assurance process and recall procedures”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

54. Do you agree to include KPI C2.5: “Description of consumer data protection and privacy policies, how they are implemented and monitored”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

55. Do you have additional KPIs for Aspect C2?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

We propose to include “Average number of days to settle a complaint incident” as a KPI for Aspect C2.

“Average number of days to settle a complaint incident” provides a perspective regarding the issuer’s responsiveness to customers’ or the general public’s complaints. This index may serve as an indicator of how efficiently a reported incident, on average, is handled and resolved by the issuer.

Aspect C3    Anti-corruption

56. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C3: Anti-corruption?

Information on:

(a) the policies; and

(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on bribery, extortion, fraud and money laundering.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

57. Do you agree to include KPI C3.1: “Number of concluded legal cases regarding corrupt practices brought against the issuer or its employees during the reporting period and the outcomes of the cases”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

58. Do you agree to include KPI C3.2: “Description of preventive measures and whistle-blowing procedures, how they are implemented and monitored”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

59. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect C3?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

**D. Community involvement**

Aspect D1    Community investment

60. Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect D1: Community investment?

Policies on understanding the community’s needs in where it operates and ensuring its activities takes into consideration of communities’ interests.

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

61. Do you agree to include KPI D1.1: “Focus areas of contribution (e.g. education, environmental concerns, labour needs, health, culture, sport)”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

62. Do you agree to include KPI D1.2: “Resources contributed (e.g. money or time) to the focus area”?

Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

Not applicable.

63. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect D1?

Yes

No

Please give reasons for your proposals.

Not applicable.

### Assurance

64. Do you agree that we should not recommend that issuers to seek external assurance for issuers that report on ESG performance?



Yes

No

If your answer is “No”, please give reasons and alternative views.

We are of the view that a certain level of assurance is needed to enhance the creditability of information disclosed by issuers on ESG performance. However, instead from external assurance, assurance could also be sought from other independent resources such as the internal audit organization of the issuers.

- End -