

Corporate Communications Department Hong Kong Exchanges and Clearing Limited 12th Floor, One International Finance Centre 1 Harbour View Street, Central Hong Kong Mn Services N.V. P.O. Box 5210 2280 HE Rijswijk The Netherlands

Burgemeester Elsenlaan 329 Rijswijk T +31 (0)70 316 01 60 F +31 (0)70 316 04 75 www.mn.nl

CoC: 27191631

Our reference

NMN2012.002/lbk

Please quote our reference on all correspondence.

Date

21 March 2012

Subject

Consultation Paper on ESG Reporting Guide

Dear

As an investor in over 100 companies listed on HKEx Mn, a Dutch fiduciary manager for over 20 pension funds with over €80 billion, is pleased to respond to the HKEx Consultation Paper on ESG Reporting Guide. Mn is a signatory to UN Principles for Responsible Investment and an active member of Sustainable Stock Exchanges Initiative.

We strongly welcome the efforts of your exchange to promote greater disclosure on ESG issues among HKEx listed companies, the update to the Corporate Governance code and the development of the ESG Reporting Guide. We hope these efforts will lead to continued improvement in companies' ESG performance and disclosure.

Based on our engagement with a number of companies listed on your exchange the overall level of transparency and disclosure of material ESG risks and opportunities remains low and often falls below our expectations. While we do understand that HKEx would like to take a gradual approach to introduction of ESG Reporting we would strongly welcome if you were to elevate this guide to Comply and Explain level in due time.

We are attaching a detailed response to the consultation paper with our comments on specific indicators but also wanted to highlight a few issues we see as being particularly important in this letter.

GRI, CDP and sector focused reporting

Overall we broadly support the selected indicators in the ESG reporting guide but have proposed a few amendments or additions. We recommend the HKEx encourages the issuers to use GRI reporting framework including sector supplements as the main ESG reporting framework and CDP disclosure framework including the sector supplements as a main carbon disclosure framework. Companies should be encouraged to set quantitative performance targets and report against them. They should also be encouraged to report challenges they face



with implementing sustainability policies as this will create a more balanced and credible reporting.

We also recommend that HKSE comments on the quality of the sustainability data reported by listed companies.

Human Rights

A number of HKEx listed companies are facing human rights related issues in their operations. This is especially true for companies that operate in high risk or conflict related areas such as Sudan and Burma. Some Hong Kong listed companies do not currently disclosing sufficient information about their management of human rights related risks. However, from private discussions and engagement meeting it does emerge that some of them have taken steps to address these issues and manage risks. Therefore we would propose to add additional human rights GRI indicators into the ESG Reporting Guide.

Online resources

We applaud the ESG training workshops for issuers that exchange has hosted and the publication of related materials and ESG resources online. There is a growing body of international principles and best practices that may serve to help companies develop human rights policy and perform human rights assessment. As we mentioned above, given that this areas is specifically of concern to international investors we would appreciate if you could add the links to the following three human rights related best practices to your ESG Resource Hyperlinks section.

- 1. We particularly refer to the "Voluntary Principles on Security and Human Rights" http://www.voluntaryprinciples.org/files/voluntary-principles-english.pdf, which are relevant for companies operating in the extractive and mining sectors
- 2. "Guiding Principles for the Implementation of the UN 'Protect, Respect and Remedy' Framework"
 - http://www.ohchr.org/documents/issues/business/A.HRC.17.31.pdf and to the
- "Guidance on Responsible Business in High Risk and Conflict Affected Areas" that
 was developed in close cooperation between major extractive companies and
 investors:
 - http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues doc/Peace and Business/Guidanc e RB.pdf

We appreciate this opportunity to comment on the guide and look forward to continuing discussions. Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any further questions or comments.

Yours Sincerely,

Part B Consultation Questions

Please indicate your preference by checking the appropriate boxes. Please reply to the questions below on the proposed changes discussed in the Consultation Paper downloadable from the HKEx website at: http://www.hkex.com.hk/eng/newsconsul/mktconsul/Documents/cp201112.pdf.

Where there is insufficient space provided for your comments, please attach additional pages.

1. Should the ESG Guide be a recommended best practice appended to the Listing Rules?

Yes

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

We welcome all the work that HKSE has done in this area.

We suggest that overtime the exchange also defines the minimum expectations for sustainability reporting by sector for new listings and provides training for the listing committee on understanding the submitted data.

2. Do you agree with the proposed Main Board Listing Rule 13.91 and paragraph 53 of Appendix 16/ GEM Listing Rules 17.103 and 18.84 in Appendix I of the Consultation Paper?

Yes

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Provide a detailed response.

Overall we understand the position of HKSE of currently not elevating the ESG Guide to the level of comply to explain. However we encourage the exchange to move in this direction and elevate the guide to comply or explain level in the future.

Content of the proposed Environmental, Social and Governance Reporting Guide

Introduction

3. Do you agree with the Introduction section?

The proposed Introduction section states:

- 1. This guide sets out Environmental, Social and Governance ("ESG") subject areas, aspects, general disclosure and key performance indicators ("KPIs").
- 2. This guide is not comprehensive. We encourage an issuer to identify and disclose additional ESG issues and KPIs that are relevant to its business. It may also refer to existing international ESG reporting guidance for its relevant industry or sector.
- 3. An issuer may adopt a higher level of ESG reporting based on international guidance and standards.
- 4. An issuer may disclose the ESG information in its annual report regarding the same period covered in the annual report, or in a separate report, in print or on its website. Where the information is included in a separate report, an issuer is free to report on any period.
- 5. It is important to involve the board of directors in preparing the ESG report. The board of directors is responsible for ESG reporting but it may delegate the task of compiling the ESG report to its employees or a committee that reports to the board.

Yes		
If your answer is "No", pl	ease give reasons and alternative views.	

General Approach

4. Do you agree with the guidance under the General Approach section?

The proposed General Approach section states:

Identify subject areas, aspects and indicators that are relevant

- 8. Not all ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs in this Guide may be relevant to an issuer's business. Also, some may be more important to an issuer's business than others. For example, product responsibility, an ESG aspect, may be important to a retailer.
- 9. The ESG report could prioritise ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs that are material in the context of its corporate strategy, which could be given prominence in the report.
- 10. It is unnecessary to report on all subject areas, aspects and KPIs. An issuer could identify and report on relevant ESG subject areas, aspects and KPIs that have material environmental and social impacts. Materiality can be addressed in strategic, operational and financial terms.

Engage stakeholders

- 11. It is important to engage stakeholders to identify material aspects and KPIs and understand their views. Stakeholders are parties that have interests in or are affected by the decisions and activities of an issuer. They may include shareholders (including independent shareholders), business partners, employees, suppliers, sub-contractors, consumers, regulators and the public.
- 12. The ESG report could disclose the issuer's stakeholders and the basis for their identification. It may also disclose the activities the issuer has arranged to engage stakeholders, the objectives and how it has responded to stakeholders' views. Stakeholder engagement may be conducted through meetings (e.g. personal or annual general meetings), conferences, workshops, advisory committees, roundtable discussions, focus groups, questionnaires, web-based forums and written consultations.
- 13. The ESG report may also disclose a mechanism for stakeholders to provide feedback.

Yes
If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Reporting guidance

5. Do you agree with the guidance under the Reporting Guidance section?

The proposed Reporting Guidance section states:

Scope of reporting

14. The ESG report could state which entities in the group and/or which operations have been included for the report. If there is change in the scope, the issuer could explain the difference and reason for change.

Approaches to reporting

- 15. Once an issuer starts reporting, it could continue to do so regularly. The aspects and KPIs reported could be consistent for each period or there could be an explanation of the changes. An issuer may also explain why some aspects and KPIs are not reported.
- 16. An ESG report could state the issuer's ESG management approach, strategies, priorities, objectives and explain how they relate to its business. It could discuss the issuer's management, measurement and monitoring system to implement its ESG strategies.
- 17. An ESG report could also discuss ESG opportunities, risks, challenges and how they are addressed. For example, a telecommunication company may see an opportunity to promote teleconferencing as an alternative to travel due to climate change concerns. An information and technology company may see the damage to its reputation from a breach in consumer privacy as an ESG risk.

Reporting on line items

- 18. The Guide does not provide a definition for each KPI. An issuer could explain how the KPIs are calculated and include information that is necessary for interpreting the KPIs. It may use the same definition and calculation method each period for comparison over time. If there is a change to the definition or calculation method, the issuer could explain the difference and reason for the change.
- 19. Over time, an issuer may present time series of data for comparison over a period already reported on. The time period used may be consistent for every report.
- 20. An issuer may report line items with objective and representative industry benchmarks.
- 21. Quantitative information could be presented in a table format.

Yes

We would like HKSE to encourage issuers

- to use GRI and to focus as much as possible on KPIs that are material for their core business
- to use sector specific KPIs, for example GRI and CDP sector supplements
- to set quantitative performance targets
- to report on challenges they face with implementing sustainability policies as this will create a more balanced and credible reporting

Key ESG Subject Areas

6. Do you agree with the proposed ESG areas, namely: Workplace Quality, Environmental Protection, Operating Practices and Community Involvement?

Yes

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Aspects for each ESG Area

7. Do you agree with the following proposed aspects?

Areas and aspects				
Α.	Workplace quality			
Aspect A1	Working Conditions			
Aspect A2	Health and safety			
Aspect A3	Development and training			
Aspect A4	Labour standards			
В.	Environmental protection			
Aspect B1	Emissions			
Aspect B2	Use of resources			
Aspect B3	The environment and natural resources			
C.	Operating practices			
Aspect C1	Supply chain management			
Aspect C2	Product responsibility			
Aspect C3	Anti-corruption			
D.	Community involvement			
Aspect D1	Community investment			

Yes

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

A. Workplace quality

Aspect A1 Working conditions

8.	Do	you	agree	with	the	following	general	disclosure	for	Aspect	A1:	Working
	cond	lition	ıs?									

	Information on:
	(a) the policies; and
	(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations
	on compensation and dismissal, recruitment and promotion, working hours, rest periods, diversity and other benefits and welfare.
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
9.	Do you agree to include KPI A1.1: "Total workforce by employment type, age group and geographical region"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
10.	Do you agree to include KPI A1.2: "Employee turnover rate by age group and geographical region"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
	Add "Employee by type"
11.	Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A1?
	Yes

Please give reasons for your proposals.

To ensure that the working conditions are acceptable we propose to add additional KPIs on how many hours employees work per week Breakdown of pay into pay for normal work and overtime pay

Companies should also discuss how they deal with overtime work and pay for overtime work

Aspect A2 Health and safety

Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A2: Health and safety?

Information on:

- (a) the policies; and
- (b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations

on providing a safe working environment and protecting employees from occupational hazards.

Yes

12.

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

13. Do you agree to include KPI A2.1: "Fatality number and rate"?

Yes

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

We feel it is important to also include contractors here as well

14. Do you agree to include KPI A2.2: "Lost days due to work injury"?

Yes

If your answ	er is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
	ee to include KPI A2.3: "Description of occupational health and safet opted, how they are implemented and monitored"?
Yes	
If you answe	er is "No", please give reasons and alternate views.
Do you have	any additional KPIs for Aspect A2?
Yes	
Please give 1	easons for your proposals.
We feel it is additional K	important to include a KPI here on the causes of accidents and an PI on
days, and ab	ury, occupational diseases, lost senteeism, and total number ted fatalities, by region

Aspect A3 Development and training

17.	Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A3: Development and training?
	Policies on improving employees' knowledge and skills for discharging duties at work.
	Training refers to vocational training. It may include internal and external courses paid by the employer.
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
18.	Do you agree to include KPI A3.1: "Description of training activities provided and if relevant, the percentage of employees trained by employee category (e.g. senior management, middle management, etc.)"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
19.	Do you agree to include KPI A3.2: "The average training hours completed per employee by employee category"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

20.	Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A3?
	Yes
	Please give reasons for your proposals.
	Include on which topics employees get training
	Aspect A4 Labour standards
21.	Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect A4: Labour standards?
	Information on:
	(a) the policies; and
	(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations
	on preventing child or forced labour.
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
22.	Do you agree to include KPI A4.1: "Description of measures to review employmen practices to avoid child and forced labour"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
	We think it is important to also add here not only own operations but also "major or significant suppliers"

23.	Do you agree to include KPI A4.2: "Description of steps taken to eliminate such
	practices when discovered"?

Yes

If you answer is "No", please give reasons and alternate views.

We think it is important to also add here not only own operations but also "major or significant suppliers

24. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect A4?

Yes

Please give reasons for your proposals.

A number of HKEx listed companies are facing human rights related issues in their operations. This is especially true for companies that operate in high risk or conflict related areas such as Sudan and Burma. As shareholders in these companies want to make sure that investee companies are managing risks associated with violating the human rights or with being complacent with Human Rights violations. Some Hong Kong listed companies do not currently disclosure sufficient information about their management of human rights related risks especially in their operations abroad. However, from private discussions and engagement meeting it does emerge that some of them have taken steps to address these issues and manage risks. Therefore we would propose to add additional indicators that focus on providing more transparency about how companies manage Human Rights risks.

HR2 Percentage of significant suppliers, contractors, and other business partners that have undergone human rights screening, and actions taken.

HR10 Percentage and total number of operations that have been subject to human rights reviews and/or impact assessments.
HR11 Number of grievances related to human rights filed, addressed and resolved through formal grievance mechanisms.

We would also appreciate if you could add the links to the following three human rights related best practices for companies to your ESG Resource Hyperlinks section.

- 1. We particularly refer to the "Voluntary Principles on Security and Human Rights" http://www.voluntaryprinciples.org/files/voluntary_principles_english.pdf, which are relevant for companies operating in the extractive and mining sectors
- 2. "Guiding Principles for the Implementation of the UN 'Protect, Respect and Remedy' Framework"

http://www.ohchr.org/documents/issues/business/A.HRC.17.31.pdf and to the

3. "Guidance on Responsible Business in High Risk and Conflict Affected Areas" that was developed in close cooperation between major extractive companies and investors:

http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues_doc/Peace_and_Business/Guidance_R B.pdf

B. **Environmental protection**

	Aspect B1 Emissions
25.	Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect B1: Emissions?
	Information on:
	(a) the policies; and
	(b) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations
	on air and greenhouse gas emissions, discharges into water and land, generation of hazardous and non-hazardous wastes, etc.
	Air emissions include NO_X , SO_X , and other pollutants regulated under national laws and regulations.
	Greenhouse gases include carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide, hydrofluorocarbons, perfluorocarbons and sulphur hexafluoride.
	Hazardous wastes are those defined by national regulations.
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
26.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.1: "The types of emissions and respective emissions data"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

27.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.2: "Greenhouse gas emissions in total (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
28.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.3: "Total hazardous waste produced (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
29.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.4: "Total non-hazardous waste produced (in tonnes) and where appropriate, intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
30.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.5: "Description of measures to mitigate emissions and results achieved"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
31.	Do you agree to include KPI B1.6: "Description of how hazardous and non-hazardous wastes are handled, reduction initiatives and results achieved"?
	Yes

Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect B1? No
Please give reasons for your proposals.
Aspect B2 Use of resources
Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect B2: Use of resource
Policies on efficient use of resources including energy, water and other materials.
Resources may be used in production, in storage, transportation, in building electronic equipment, etc.

34.	Do you agree to include KPI B2.1: "Energy consumption by type (e.g. electricity, gas or oil) in total (kwh in '000s) and intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)"?					
	Yes					
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternate views.					
35.	Do you agree to include KPI B2.2: "Water consumption in total and intensity (e.g. per unit of production volume, per facility)"?					
	Yes					
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternate views.					
36.	Do you agree to include KPI B2.3: "Description of energy use efficiency initiatives and results achieved"?					
	Yes					
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.					
37.	Do you agree to include KPI B2.4: "Description of whether there is any issue in sourcing water that is fit for purpose, water efficiency initiatives and results achieved"?					
	Yes					
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.					
38.	Do you agree to include KPI B2.5: "Total packaging material used (in tonnes), and if applicable, with reference to per unit produced"?					
	Yes					

Do you have	any additional KPIs for Aspect B2?
Yes	
Please give r	easons for your proposals.
be useful to We also feel EN9 Water s withdrawal o	ntage and total volume of water
Aspect B3 Do you agre and natural re	The environment and natural resources e with the following general disclosure for Aspect B3: The environments: esources?
Policies on natural reso	minimizing the operation's significant impact on the environmenturces.
Yes	
T.C	er is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

41.	Do you agree to include KPI B3.1: "Total paper used"?
	No
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
	We feel this is not a very useful KPI
42.	Do you agree to include KPI B3.2: "Paper use efficiency initiatives and results achieved"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
43.	Do you agree to include KPI B3.3: "Description of the significant impacts of activities on the environment and natural resources and the actions taken to manage them"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
44.	Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect B3?
	Yes
	Please give reasons for your proposals.

We would like companies to provide information about their involvement in environmentally sensitive areas and report on policies that they have to protect biodiversity and ecosystems

EN12 Description of significant impacts of activities, products, and services on biodiversity in protected areas and areas of high biodiversity value outside protected areas.

C.	Operating practices
	Aspect C1 Supply chain management
45.	Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C1: Supply chair management?
	Policies on risk management of supply chain.
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
46.	Do you agree to include KPI C1.1: "Number of suppliers by geographical region"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
	We would like this KPI to also include volume or value of how much is sourced per supplier not just the number of suppliers
47.	Do you agree to include KPI C1.2: "Description of practices relating to engaging suppliers, number of suppliers where the practices are being implemented, how they are implemented and monitored"?
	Yes
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

Do yo	ou have any additional KPIs for Aspect C1?						
Yes							
Please	e give reasons for your proposals						
	would like companies to report on their supplier audit against labour, conmental standards and results of such audits						
Aspe	ct C2 Product responsibility						
-	you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C2: Product insibility?						
Info	rmation on:						
(a)	the policies; and						
(b)	compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and regulations						
on h	on health and safety, advertising, labelling, privacy and methods of redress.						
Yes If you	ar answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.						
Do you agree to include KPI C2.1: "Percentage of total products sold or shipped subject to recalls for safety and health reasons"?							
Yes							
If you	ar answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.						
	you agree to include KPI C2.2: "Number of products and service related plaints received and how they are dealt with"?						

If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
Do you agree to include KPI C2.3: "Description of practices relating to observing and protecting intellectual property rights"?
Yes
If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
Do you agree to include KPI C2.4: "Description of quality assurance process and recall procedures"?
Yes
If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
Do you agree to include KPI C2.5: "Description of consumer data protection and privacy policies, how they are implemented and monitored"? Yes
If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.
Do you have additional KPIs for Aspect C2?
Do you have additional KPIs for Aspect C2? Yes Please give reasons for your proposals.

Yes

We would like companies to explain what measures have been put in place to make sure the incidents do not happen again In addition we would like to suggest the following KPIs PR6 Programs for adherence to laws, standards, and voluntary codes related to marketing communications, including advertising, promotion, and sponsorship. PR9 Monetary value of significant fines for noncompliance with laws and regulations concerning the provision and use of products and services. Aspect C3 **Anti-corruption** Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect C3: Anti-corruption? Information on: the policies; and (a) compliance and material non-compliance with relevant standards, rules and (b) regulations on bribery, extortion, fraud and money laundering. Yes If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views. Do you agree to include KPI C3.1: "Number of concluded legal cases regarding corrupt practices brought against the issuer or its employees during the reporting period and the outcomes of the cases"? Yes If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

56.

57.

Yes If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views. Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect C3?
De ann han ann difficul KDL C. A. (C22)
De see less and distant VDI C A COO
Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect C3?
Yes
Please give reasons for your proposals.
We would like to add a KPI on the number and type of cases not only related to corruption but also other anti-competitive practices and insider trading
We feel it is important for companies to do corruption risk assessment and to train employees in anti-corruption policies. It is also important to know what actions were taken in response to corruption incidents SO3 Percentage of employees trained in organization's anti-corruption policies and
procedures. SO4 Actions taken in response to incidents of corruption.
Community involvement
Aspect D1 Community investment
Do you agree with the following general disclosure for Aspect D1: Community investment?
Policies on understanding the community's needs in where it operates and ensuring its activities takes into consideration of communities' interests.
Yes
If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.

61.	Do you agree to include KPI D1.1: "Focus areas of contribution (e.g. education environmental concerns, labour needs, health, culture, sport)"?				
	Yes				
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.				
62.	Do you agree to include KPI D1.2: "Resources contributed (e.g. money or time) to the focus area"?				
	No				
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.				
	We feel this may be used more as PR by companies				
63.	Do you have any additional KPIs for Aspect D1? Yes				
	Please give reasons for your proposals.				
	We would like to see a KPI about the grievances mechanisms in place and also for companies to report on				
	Percentage of operations with implemented local community engagement, impact assessments, and development programs.				
	Operations with significant potential or actual negative impacts on local communities.				
	Prevention and mitigation measures implemented in operations with significant potential or actual negative impacts on local communities.				
Assur	rance				
64.	Do you agree that we should not recommend that issuers to seek external assurance for issuers that report on ESG performance?				
	No				
	If your answer is "No", please give reasons and alternative views.				

Having assured report gives it more credibility. Issues should seek to assure their reports where possible

- End -